Safety culture analysis based on safety climate factors at production unit of PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantations, TBK Indonesia

Ihsan T¹, Sakdiah D.S.², Regia R.A.³, Derosya V.⁴

Taufiq Ihsan¹, Dita Sophy Sakdiah², Rinda Andhita Regia³, ^{1,2,3}authors are attached with Environmental Engineering Department, Faculty of Engineering Universitas Andalas, Kampus Limau Manis Padang, Indonesia, Vioni Derosya⁴ Agroindustrial Technology Department, Faculty of Agriculture Universitas Andalas Kampus Limau Manis, Padang, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Taufiq Ihsan, Environmental Engineering Department, Faculty of Engineering Universitas Andalas, Kampus Limau Manis Padang, Indonesia. E-mail: taufiqihsan@eng.unand.ac.id

......

Abstract

Background: PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantations Tbk (PT. BSP) was one of the largest rubber factories with environmental concern and a rubber exporter in Indonesia. This study aimed to analyse the assessment and influence of safety culture toward safety climate and company management at the Production Area of PT. BSP. Method: The data were collected by distributing questionnaires referring to Safety Climate Questionnaire to all workers in the production area (159 respondents). The questionnaire consisted of 41 questions/ statements in seven safety climate variables: communications and procedures, work pressure, management commitment, work relationships, training, safety rules, and safety behaviour. Result: Based on the results of the questionnaire showed 93% of all statements in the questionnaire, get a good response from respondents. This result indicates that the safety culture in PT. BSP was good. The correlation analysis showed that safety culture at PT. BSP was influenced by work pressure (r = 0.758), management commitment (r = 0.758), management commitment (r = 0.758). = 0.717) and training (r = 0.617). Balanced work pressure allowed workers to complete their work without haste. This condition was undoubtedly supported by the commitment of proper management that raises workers' confidence in their safety. Besides, through the implementation of training, workers could raise awareness of safety. This situation affected the safety habits that exist in PT. BSP. Nevertheless, the communication and procedures; work relationship; and safety rules variables were not yet compatible with the safety climate. Conclusions: PT. BSP should make improvements by allowing all employees to discuss and advises on occupational health and safety improvement efforts at the factory as well as provide training to their employees equally.

Keywords: Production Unit, PT. BSP, Safety Climate, Safety Culture

......

Introduction

PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantations Tbk (BSP) was one of the rubber factories in Indonesia, which was environmentally friendly by utilizing raw materials obtained from PT. BSP itself and was one of the exporters in the rubber industry, with a land area of 18.950 Ha. PT. BSP was able to produce 8,907.56 tons of Cenex, 13,542.50 tons of Crumb Rubber, and 4,919.4 tons of Rubber Block Skim. Large production conducted by PT. The BSP was balanced by the management of human resource as a frontline in rubber production and environmental management [1].

Manuscript received: 24th September 2019 Reviewed: 4th October 2019 Author Corrected: 9th October 2019 Accepted for Publication: 14th October 2019 PT. BSP has been awarded a golden flag for the Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) Management System for its success in meeting 91% of 166 OHSMS audit criteria based on Government Regulation No. 50 of 2012. Application of Good Safety culture at PT. BSP was also proven by achieving a Zero Accident from the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration of the Republic of Indonesia [2].

The success of PT. BSP in achieving the award cannot be separated from the development of management that affects OHS factors in reducing the number of accidents and occupational diseases, among others, perceptions of safety and implementation in the company.

Original Research Article

Print ISSN: 2349-4158. Online ISSN: 2349-4166

This perception was influenced by internal aspects such as management efforts in creating a safe working atmosphere, smooth communication between the management and workers, the presence of OHS training and the existence of safety rules [3-5].

Therefore, this research was conducted as an analysis of OHS implementation and safety culture, which has been applied by PT. BSP to find out whether the workplace safety climate has a significant impact on workers' safe behaviour during work, and whether safety climate

factors such as work and communication and procedures, workplace pressures, management commitments, relationships, training and safety rules, and other factors may result in the growth of safe working behaviours in the factory environment.

The research was also conducted to analyse whether proper management creates a working climate, improve and improve OHS Management System in the company so that later PT. BSP was able to become a pilot in the OHS field for other companies.

Method

Study design: This study was a prospective, randomized, and a community based cross-sectional.

Study setting: The Production Area of PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantations TBK (PT. BSP) in Bunut, Kisaran, North Sumatera, Indonesia, which produces four products with rubber raw materials.

Study duration: The study was conducted from November 2018 to March 2019. Data collection was done during November and December 2018.

Study population and sample size: All workers at The Production Area of PT. BSP (159 workers) was the respondents of this study.

Study tool: The questionnaire used in this study was the Safety Climate Questionnaire (SCQ) [6, 7] consisting of seven variables and 41 factors/ statements and has been adapted to the current conditions. The questionnaire was made with Likert scale that is 1 to 5 (1 = Never, 2 = Rarely, 3 = Sometimes, 4 = Frequently, 5 = Always).

Inclusion criteria: All workers at The Production Area of PT. BSP.

Exclusion criteria: Eligible respondents not willing to consent.

Procedure of data collection: The data was collected by distributing questionnaires at The Production Area of PT. BSP. All workers of the production area in PT. BSP were contacted and obtained permission for data collection during their working days or any other possible days when workers can gather.

Data analysis: Statements from respondents were grouped into variables and answers. The respondent's explanation was analysed by T-Test, with a 95% confidence level using statistical software (SPSS). Furthermore, Spearman Rank Interaction was conducted to see if there was any effect on performance improvement with the initial hypothesis that all would agree and give a good response to the company. All statistical tests were analysed by using statistical software for windows. Table 1 can be seen variables and factors used in this study.

Table-1: Safety climate factors.

Comm	Communication and procedures			
Code	Factors			
1	Changes in work procedures and their effects on safety are effectively communicated to workers			
2	Consultation with employees when there are changes to safety practices			
3	Employees are notified of any change in procedures in the work environment			
4	Safety policies related to work safety are effectively communicated to workers			
5	Work-related safety procedures are complete and comprehensive			
6	An effective management documentation system ensures the availability of safety procedures related to occupational safety			
7	Safety issues are openly discussed between employees and managers / supervisors			
8	Safety procedures are in accordance with the tasks performed in practice			
9	Employees can discuss important policy safety issues			
10	Employees may consult and advise on safety improvements			
11	Employees can easily identify the relevant procedures for each job			
12	Employees can express their views on safety issues			
13	Employees are encouraged to support each other			

Print ISSN: 2349-4158, Online ISSN: 2349-4166 Original Research Article

Working pressure		
Code	Factors	
1	The timetable for completing realistic work projects	
2	There is enough "thinking time" to allow employees to plan and execute their work to an adequate standard	
3	The workload is quite balanced	
4	There are enough employees to carry out the required work	
5	Changes in workloads, which have been made in a short time, can be dealt with in ways that do not affect occupational safety	
6	When working employees have enough time to carry out their duties	
7	Issues arising outside of employee control can be dealt with in ways that do not affect worker safety	

Manag	Management commitment			
Code	Factors			
1	Management is committed to safety			
2	Management is committed to securing tools			
3	Worker safety is central to values and management philosophy			
4	Worker safety as an important part and organization of the company			
Work	relationship			
Code	Factors			
1	A good working relationship between workers in this organization/company			
2	Employees are confident about their future with the organization/enterprise spirit of good			
3	Employee trust management			
4	Employee trust management			
Traini	ng			
Code	Factors			
1	Potential risks and consequences identified in safety training			
2	Safety training is provided as well as specific skills			
3	Safety training is conducted by people with relevant experience			
Safety	rules			
Code	Factors			
1	Safety rules may be followed without conflict			
2	Safety rules are done without haste			
3	Safety rules are always practical			
Safety	behaviour			
Code	Factors			
1	I remind other workers about the dangers and safety of work			
2	I always use safety equipment (self-protection tool)			
3	Safety rules related to work safety are always practical			
4	I put the materials and equipment in place			
5	I work to follow the work in accordance with the instructions of supervisors			
6	I am not joking with colleagues while working			
7	I am not doing dangerous activities like running, throwing or jumping			

Original Research Article

Print ISSN: 2349-4158, Online ISSN: 2349-4166

Results

Respondents in this study were all workers in the production unit owned by PT. BSP, Tbk totaling 159 people. The characteristics of respondents were grouped as follows:

Based on the data obtained shows that 8.9% of respondents were under 20 years old, 60.4% are 20-30 years old; 20.2% were aged 30-40 years, 6.7% are 40-50 years old, and the remaining 3.8% are over 50 years old. It was clear that most respondents were productive workers (20-50 years). The majority of respondents who had work experience $\geq 1 \leq 10$ years was 64%, 23.9% have worked 10-20 years, 9.4% have been working 20-30 years, and 2.6% has been working for more than 30 years. Respondents who have been working for a long time were expected to be able to carry out their work better.

Employee duration had a positive effect on employee professionals, meaning the longer the service life of the employee, the better the employee professional; and employee duration had a positive impact on employee performance, it means that the longer the service life of the employee, the better the employee performance and better prepared to face work stress [8-11].

Based on the data obtained shows that 54% of respondents are senior high school graduates, 25.8% diploma graduate or bachelor degree, 12.6% junior high school and the rest 7.6% are primary school graduates. Education as an effort planned to influence others either individuals, groups, or communities so that they did what the educational offender expects [8, 9, 12]. Characteristics of Respondents can be seen in Table 2.

Table-2: Characteristics of respondents.

Characteristics	Category	Frequency	Percentage
	≤20	14	8.9
	>20 s/d ≤30	96	60.4
Age (year)	>30 s/d ≤40	32	20.2
	>40 s/d ≤50	11	6.7
	>50	6	3.8
	≥1 s/d ≤10	102	64.1
Work averagion as (voor)	≥10 s/d ≤20	38	23.9
Work experience (year)	≥20 s/d ≤30	15	9.4
	>30	4	2.6
	Primary school	12	7.6
Education level	Junior high school	20	12.6
Education level	Senior high school	86	54
	Diploma/bachelor degree	41	25.8

Data processing followed by the recapitulation of the respondent's answer and t-test. If t arithmetic ≥ t table with a significance value ≥ 0.05), then there was a uniformity of safety culture that has been applied by the company with that done by workers and vice versa. The recapitulation results for hypothetical Factors initially rejected can be seen in Table 3.

Table-3: Hypothesis rejected.

Variable	t	Sig. (2-tailed)	Hypothesis	Result
Communication and procedures	3.196	0.033	Employees can discuss important policy safety issues	Rejected
Communication and procedures	3.340	0.029	Employees may consult and advise on safety improvements	Rejected
Training	2.948	0.042	Safety training is provided as well as specific skills	Rejected

Based on correlation analysis of Rank Spearman correlation between safety behaviors variable to six safety climate variables with a 95% confidence level (A p-value < 0.05 was considered statistically significant) can be seen in Table 4 below.

Table-4: Correlation value between variables.

Variables	R	Sig
Communication and procedures	0.573	0.071
Working presssure	0.758	0.000
Management commitment	0.717	0.000
Work relationship	0.368	0.101
Training	0.617	0.014
Safety rules	0.377	0.204

Discussions

Based on the data in Table 2 shows that 96 respondents aged 20-30 years or 60.4%. Furthermore, there were 20.2% of workers aged 30-40 years. This percentage means that almost all respondents were productive workers. The performance will decline with age. Older workers were considered less flexible and could not adapt to new technology, but once the old worker had the experience, a strong work ethic, and commitment to quality.

Age was inversely proportional to absenteeism, where older workers are less likely to stop working or more fatigue. Age also affected productivity, where the older the worker decreased, the more skill, speed, dexterity, strength, and coordination decreased with time. Based on the above studies, it can be said that the older the health workforce, the less the performance [13, 14].

In Table 2, absolutely that the majority of respondents who have work experience 1 - 10 years are 64, %; and 23.9% of workers have worked 10-20 years. Respondents who have worked for a long time are expected to be able to carry out their work better. The length of time an employee has a positive effect on employee professionalism, meaning that the longer the employee's working period, the better the employee's professionalism; and employee work time has a positive effect on employee performance, meaning that the longer the employee's service life, the better the employee's performance [15, 16].

Table 2 shows that half of the respondents' education was high school level, and more than a quarter of the total respondents were a diploma or undergraduates. The education as any planned effort to influence others, whether individuals, groups or the community, so that they do what is expected by education practitioners.

From this limitation, it is implied that the elements of education are: (1) input is the target of education (individuals, groups, communities), and educators (education practitioners); (2) processes (planned efforts to influence others); (3) output (performing according to target or behaviour) [17].

Based on data processing, 93% of statements had a good response from workers. However, there were three statements whose significance value is less than 0.05 (the hypothesis was rejected), that was for the employee's report to discuss safety issues, consultation, and advice for the management of workers regarding safety regulations and the existence of specialized safety-related training to employees. Three statements require improvement in the application of safety culture at PT. BSP.

The results of the analysis using statistical software, work pressure variables, management commitments, and training have a strong and positive correlation to safety behaviours. The working pressure was balanced so that workers did not complete their work with haste, good management commitment to generate employee confidence in the safety and the training, so that raises awareness of workers to safety to affect the safety behaviours. A commitment was manifested in the form of policies that written, clear, and easily understood by all workers.

However, a commitment was not only in the form of written policies, and it needs support and supported from management to prove that the company genuinely concerned work safety. This real effort could be discussed with attitudes and all actions related to work safety [18, 19]. The causes of work in the industry, causing some workers to cut corners and take unsafe

Print ISSN: 2349-4158, Online ISSN: 2349-4166

Original Research Article

actions. One of the more common tasks for lifting goods is usually done manually and poses a risk, and this occurred because some workers involved using lifting equipment require time and increased production. The training for employees was a process of teaching specific knowledge, expertise, and attitudes so that employees become more skilled and able to carry out their responsibilities better following standards [20].

This condition was undoubtedly supported by the commitment of proper management that raises workers' confidence in their safety. Besides, through the implementation of training, workers could raise awareness of safety. This situation affected the safety habits that exist in PT. BSP.

The correlation of procedural and communication variables to safety behaviours was weak, as workers were familiar with the work and work environment, so workers were easy to make adjustments when there was a change in working procedures [21]. As for the variable working relationship and safety rules for the safety behaviours of the relationship was very weak. Management and workers were committed to professional work and put aside personal issues, personal issues at work and home so as not to affect safety behaviours while working. Workers who had received safety training will be more aware of the risks of occupational injuries so that they will perform safe working procedures without being constantly reminded of safety regulations [22-26].

The PT. BSP had a team of Health and Safety Management Committee, whose task was to make policy, target, identify hazards and risks, conduct OHS training, install safety signs, provide PPE, conduct inspections and others, and ensuring that all PDCA cycles run continuously.

Workers were no longer required to engage in the creation of safety regulations, but it did not mean that employees can not advise if the existing rules were not appropriate to the conditions in the field — employees who have long worked at PT.

BSP was involved in the manufacture or improvement of regulations in PT. BSP, the selection of old employees as one of the contributors of ideas was done because the old employees were considered to be more understanding and understand what risks will occur in the field [27-29]. In further research, factor analysis should be carried out to see the contribution of each dimension to the climate of safety.

Limitations: Since it is a cross-sectional study, enhancement, or declination in knowledge over time could not be studied. The knowledge level is studied only in a selected industry, so generalization was not possible.

Conclusions

Safety culture condition in PT. BSP was reasonably good, referring to SCQ, which shows 93% statement had a good response. Variables of work pressure, management commitment and training had a significant and robust correlation to safety behaviours. Variable communication and procedures, and training on safety climate needed improvement efforts for PT. BSP, that was, it should involve its employees in making OHS rules, allowing employees to discuss OHS issues in the workplace and provide specialized training for workers.

What this study adds to existing Knowledge?

In the aspects of Communication and Procedures, Working Press, Management Commitment, Work Relationship, Training, and Safety Rules, most of their knowledge discovered excellently, but detailed of all these aspects was a lack of many workers at the production area of PT. BSP. With this, it concluded that despite the majority of the workers of PT. BSP knows their responsibilities and knows climate safety, but further research is needed in more depth to be understandable.

Author's contribution

Taufiq Ihsan: Conceptualized the study, prepared protocols and conducted data collection, literature search, involved in data analysis, drafting and finalization of the manuscript.

Dita Sophy Sakdiah: Data collection and analysis the data.

Rinda Andhita Regia: Guided in the study design and in editing with revising the manuscript for intellectual relevance.

Vioni Derosya: Involved in data compilation, interpretation, drafting and translate the manuscript.

Acknowledgement: Authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to the Dean of the Medical College and to the institutional ethical committee for their support and guidance during this study.

Funding: Nil, Conflict of Interest: None

Funding: Nil, Conflict of Interest: None

Permission from IRB: Yes

References

- 1. PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantatios, Tbk [internet] Sustainability Report 2015; 2015 [cited 2018 Dec 15].
- 2. PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantatios, Tbk [internet] Work safety program; 2015 (cited 2018 Dec 15).
- 3. Hasebe T, Sakai T. Are elderly workers more likely to die in occupational accidents? Evidence from both industry-aggregated data and administrative individual-level data in Japan. Japan and the World Economy. 2018;48(C):79-89. doi: doi.org/10.1016 /j.japwor. 2018.09.001.
- 4. Barkhordari A, Malmir B, Malakoutikhah M. An Analysis of Individual and Social Factors Affecting Occupational Accidents. Saf Health Work. 2019;10(2):205-212. doi: 10.1016/j.shaw.2019.01.002. Epub 2019 Jan 21.
- 5. Kim KW, Park SJ, Lim HS, Cho HH. Safety Climate and Occupational Stress According to Occupational Accidents Experience and Employment Type in Shipbuilding Industry of Korea. Saf Health Work. 2017;8(3):290-295. doi: 10.1016/j.shaw.2017.08.002. Epub 2017 Aug 4.
- 6. Cooper MD, Phillips RA. Exploratory analysis of the safety climate and safety behavior relationship. J Safety Res. 2004;35 (5):497-512. doi: 10.1016/j.jsr. 2004.08.004
- 7. Kasim H, Hassan CR, Hamid MD, Emami SD, Danaee M. The relationship of safety climate factors, decision making attitude, risk control, and risk estimate in Malaysian radiation facilities. Safety Sci. 2019;113:180-191. doi: https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.ssci. 2018.11.025.
- 8. Riyadina W. Work accidents and injuries suffered by industrial workers in the Pulo Gadung industrial area, Jakarta. Jurnal Makara, Kesehatan. 2007;11(1):25-31.
- 9. Ihsan T, Edwin T, Irawan RO. Analisis Risiko K3 dengan Metode HIRARC pada area produksi PT Cahaya Murni Andalas Permai. Jurnal Kesehatan Masyarakat Andalas. 2017;10(2):179-185. doi: https://doi.org/ 10.24893/jkma.v10i2.204.
- 10. Oah S, Na R, Moon K. The influence of safety climate, safety leadership, workload, and accident experiences on risk Perception: a study of Korean manufacturing workers. Saf Health Work. 2018;9(4):

Original Research Article

- 427-433. doi: https://doi. org/10.1016/j. shaw. 2018.01.008.
- 11. Wang D, Wang X, Xia N. How safety-related stress affects workers' safety behavior: The moderating role of psychological capital. Safety Sci. 2018;103:247-259. doi: 10.1016/j.ssci.2017.11.020.
- 12. Ihsan T, Salami IR. Hubungan Antara Bahaya Fisik Lingkungan Kerja dan Beban Kerja Dengan Tingkat Kelelahan Pada Pekerja Di Divisi Stamping PT. X Indonesia. Jurnal Dampak. 2015;12(1):10-16. doi: https://doi.org/10.25077/dampak.12.1.10-16.2015.
- 13. Sholihah Q. Hanafi AS. Wanti W, Bachri AA, Hadi S. Analysis of work characteristics, years of service, and occupational safety and health culture with the pulmonary function of coal miners. Kesmas: Jurnal Kesehatan Masyarakat Nasional. 2015;10(1):24-28.
- 14. Singh V, Sharma SK, Chadha I, Singh T. Investigating the moderating effects of multi group on safety performance: The case of civil aviation. Case Studies Transport Policy. 2019;7(2):477-488.doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cstp.2019.01.002.
- 15. Fernández-Muñiz B, Montes-Peón JM, Vázquez-Ordás CJ. The role of safety leadership and working conditions in safety performance in process industries. J Loss Prevent Proc Indust. 2017;50:403-415. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jlp.2017.11.001.
- 16. Marois A, Cloutier MS, Saunier N, Godillon S, Lafond D, Vachon F. Safety, stress and work zone complexity: A field study on police officers performing on-foot traffic control. Transport Res Interdisci Perspect. 2019:100018. https://doi.org/10.1016 /j.trip. 2019. 100018.
- 17. Wang X, Xing Y, Luo L, Yu R. Evaluating the effectiveness of Behavior-Based Safety education methods for commercial vehicle drivers. Accid Anal Prev. 2018;117:114-120. doi: 10.1016/j.aap.2018.04. 008. Epub 2018 Apr 23.
- 18. Clarke S. Safety climate in an automobile manufacturing plant: The effects of work environment, job communication and safety attitudes on accidents and unsafe behaviour. Personnel Review. 2006;35(4): 413-430.doi: 10.1108/00483480610670580.
- 19. Blakey SM, Abramowitz JS. The effects of safety behaviors during exposure therapy for anxiety: Critical

Original Research Article

Print ISSN: 2349-4158. Online ISSN: 2349-4166

analysis from an inhibitory learning perspective. Clin Psychol Rev. 2016;49:1-15. doi: 10.1016/j.cpr.2016.07. 002. Epub 2016 Jul 25.

- 20. Ji M, Liu B, Li H, Yang S, Li Y. The effects of safety attitude and safety climate on flight attendants' proactive personality with regard to safety behaviors. Journal of Air Transport Management. 2019;78(C):80-86. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jairtraman. 2019.05.003.
- 21. Sari RE. Kepatuhan Peraturan Keselamatan Kerja Sebagai Mediator Pengaruh Iklim Keselamatan Kerja terhadap Kecenderungan Mengalami Kecelakaan Kerja. Jurnal Psikologi" MANDIRI". 2014;1(1).
- 22. Zohar D, Luria G. Climate as a social-cognitive construction of supervisory safety practices: scripts as proxy of behavior patterns. J Appl Psychol. 2004;89(2):322-333. doi: 10.1037/0021-9010.89.2.322.
- 23. Xia N, Wang X, Griffin MA, Wu C, Liu B. Do we see how they perceive risk? An integrated analysis of risk perception and its effect on workplace safety behavior. Accid Anal Prev. 2017;106:234-242. doi: 10.1016/j.aap.2017.06.010. Epub 2017 Jun 20.
- 24. Givehchi S, Hemmativaghef E, Hoveidi H. Association between safety leading indicators and

- safety climate levels. J Safety Res. 2017;62:23-32. doi: 10.1016/j.jsr.2017.05.003. Epub 2017 May 18.
- 25. Smith TD, Hughes K, DeJoy DM, Dyal MA. Assessment of relationships between work stress, workfamily conflict, burnout and firefighter safety behavior outcomes. Safety Sci. 2018;103:287-292. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssci.2017.12.005.
- 26. DeJoy DM, Gershon RR, Schaffer BS. Safety climate: Assessing management and organizational influences on safety. Prof Saf. 2004;49(7):50-57.
- 27. Liu X, Huang G, Huang H, Wang S, Xiao Y, Chen W. Safety climate, safety behavior, and worker injuries in the Chinese manufacturing industry. Safety Sci. 2015;78:173-178.doi:10.1016/j.ssci.2015.04.023.
- 28. Guo BH, Goh YM, Wong KL. A system dynamic view of a behavior-based safety program in the construction industry. Safety Sci. 2018;104:202-215. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssci.2018.01.014.
- 29. Bronkhorst B, Tummers L, Steijn B. Improving safety climate and behavior through a multifaceted intervention: Results from a field experiment. Safety Sci. 2018;103:293-304. doi: 10.1016/j.ssci.2017.12.009.

How to cite this article?

Ihsan T, Sakdiah D.S., Regia R.A., Derosya V. Safety culture analysis based on safety climate factors at production unit of PT. Bakrie Sumatera Plantations, TBK Indonesia. Public health Rev: Int J Public health Res 2019;6(5):184-191.doi:10.17511/ijphr.2019.i5.02.